How to Rate Headlines and Graphics

Now that you have rated the Expression and Veracity of the overall article, let’s rate the headline and graphic.

The reason we rate the headline and graphic after we read the article is because we want to see if the headline and graphic match up well with the article. When they don’t match, that is really big indicator of lower reliability. In our methodology, when headlines and graphics score low, the whole article scores quite low as well. The reason why is because studies show that headlines and graphics are seen by a much wider audience than the actual article itself. Low-quality headlines and graphics are often crafted specifically to get people to click on them, and as a result, they can be quite misleading.

Let’s start with the Graphic Scoring Scale:

Graphics can be good or bad quality in many ways, but the primary aspects we are measuring are relevance and fairness. Relevance goes from very relevant (1) to so irrelevant it is false (5) and fairness goes from very fair (1) to very unfair (5).

1-Timely, relevant, conveys subject of story, straightforward, conveys importance of story, is fair
2-Conveys or evokes some analysis or conclusion, but not unfairly. Less relevant than 1, but still acceptable.
3-Not timely, relevant, or reflective of story, or conveys some unfairness (e.g., a slightly unflattering picture of a politician, stock photo reflecting stereotypes)
4-Conveys overt unfairness or is misleading (e.g., a very unflattering picture of a politician, unfair focus, not about the story)
5-Conveys extreme unfairness, is very misleading as to the content of the article, or falsely represents the subject of the story.

Next, let’s move to the Headline Scoring Scale:

Headlines are scored by taking into account the relevance/fairness scale used for scoring graphics above plus the below Veracity/Expression scale use for all text. As I mentioned in the previous videos, Veracity and Expression are the two main things we take into consideration on the overall reliability scale. Naturally, part of what we are looking for in the headline and graphic are the veracity and expression of the graphic.

As a recap, here’s what our Veracity and Expression scales cover:

Veracity:
1-True (Easily provable and widely accepted)
2-Mostly True (Mostly provable and mostly accepted)
3-Neither True nor False (Neither provable nor disprovable; subject to debate)
4-Mostly False (Mostly disprovable and the facts disproving are mostly accepted)
5-False (Easily disprovable and the facts disproving are widely accepted)

Expression:
1-(Presented as) Fact
2-(Presented as) Fact with some Analysis
3-(Presented as) Analysis
4-(Presented as) Analysis with some Opinion
5-(Presented as) Opinion

Go ahead and rate the headline and graphic on the slider from 1-5 based on these scales we just discussed.

Now that you have read the whole article, you can do your most important final check, which is to determine whether the headline and graphic match the article. If they do, the headline and graphic can remain between 1 and 3, if that is where you rated it. If it is misleading or worse, though, it should be rated as a 4 or 5.